Wilkins. Duckworth, London, 2000. Pp. xx + 556, with frontispiece, 11 figures, and 6 line-drawings. £58.00.

6. *Aristophanes and the Definition of Comedy*. By M. S. Silk. Oxford U.P., 2000. Pp. 456. £50.00.

7. *The Boastful Chef: the Discourse of Food in Ancient Greek Comedy*. By John Wilkins. Oxford U.P., 2000. Pp. xxviii + 465. £55.00.

8. *Aristophanes*, *Birds*, *Lysistrata*, *Women at the Thesmophoria*. LCL 179. Edited and translated by Jeffrey Henderson. Harvard U.P., 2000. Pp. vi + 618. £12.95.

9. *Menander*. Volume III. LCL 460. Edited and translated by W. Geoffrey Arnott. Harvard U.P., 2000. Pp. ix + 639. £12.95.

10. *The Ancient Quarrel between Philosophy and Poetry Revisited*. Plato and the Greek Literary Tradition. By Susan B. Levin. Oxford U.P., 2001. Pp. xii + 212. £30.00.

11. *Matrices of Genre: Authors, Canons, and Society*. Center for Hellenic Studies Colloquia 4. Edited by Mary Depew and Dirk Obbink. Harvard U.P., 2000. Pp. vi + 346. £34.50.

Roman Literature

Interestingly, this issue's collection of works on Roman Literature starts with four full-length books, all by women. The other four books, all by men, are editions of standard works. I mention this partly as a mere curiosity but partly because so many of these eight works touch on the ever-fascinating question of the relationship between men and women in literature and society. Readers of Plautine comedy have traditionally been very uncertain as to how to interpret the plays within the social context in which they were produced. Is the dominant factor the apparently subversive farce or the eventual reassertion of normality? If the plays are subversive, how were they allowed to enjoy so prominent a place in Roman civic tradition? It is to questions such as these that Kathleen McCarthy addresses herself in B★★*Slaves, Masters and the Art of Authority in Plautine Comedy*.[1] After a short Preface and an introductory chapter on general approaches, we are given four chapters on, respectively, *Menaechmi*, *Calsina*, *Persa*, and *Captivi* followed by a brief Conclusion on the role of the clever slave in sustaining the social order both in Plautine terms and in the much better documented American South. M.'s style is refreshingly direct and well rooted in Plautus' text. Her arguments are from time to time usefully illustrated by reference to parallels in modern popular culture, references for which she seems strangely obliged to apologize; some, at least, of the allusions to modern theoretical criticism, for which she does not apologize, often seem, to this reader at least, only to delay the argument. This is a very challenging and interesting work which Plautine scholars will need to absorb slowly; whether or not the conclusions stand, it is hard not to believe that the questions are and will remain pertinent. Monica Gale's B★★*Virgil on the Nature of Things*. The *Georgics*, Lucretius and the Didactic Tradition[2] is a natural development of her previous work on Lucretius. 17 pages of Introduction first briefly outline the history of modern scholarship on the character of Virgil's *Georgics* in general and its relationship to Lucretius' *de Rerum Natura* in particular: she notes a polarization of attitude between those who regard the *Georgics* as broadly pessimistic and subversive and those who see it as optimistic and supportive of the Augustan regime. Then, at greater length, she takes us through the apparently compulsory mire of theoretical stances on 'intertextuality', 'allusion', and 'authorial intention' to establish a nevertheless unassailably sensible approach to the issue of how to recognize and interpret allusion in the one to the other. Six chapters follow on topics such as 'Beginnings and endings', 'The gods, the farmer and the natural world', 'The wonders

https://doi.org/10.1093/gr/48.2.233 Published online by Cambridge University Press

of the natural world' in which G. develops her picture of Virgil's *Georgics* as a work which has 'two voices', so that the two interpretations, one optimistic and one pessimistic, can be reconciled. All this is drawn together in an Epilogue which seeks to clarify the position by, for instance, contrasting Cicero's *de Natura Deorum* where we encounter 'an interim position which can be held provisionally unless and until it is proved untenable' with the *Georgics* where 'Virgil offers his readers different ways of understanding the world, but does not give us any clear indication of how we are to choose between them.' Readers will inevitably disagree on whether G.'s answers always satisfy but few will doubt the importance and interest of the questions posed. In her B★★*Horace and the Gift Economy of Patronage*,[3] an extremely densely written work, Phebe Lowell Bowditch sets out to demonstrate the wholly reasonable proposition that it is impossible to understand the principles behind Horace's relationship with Augustus and Maecenas without a familiarity with the principles of social intercourse in the Rome of that era. She also believes that there are some fundamental anthropological truths about gift exchange that can illuminate our understanding of the patronal relationship between Horace and his patrons. Unfortunately, a relentless pursuit of the modern scholarly literature delays and obfuscates the argument intolerably. Furthermore, the book's practice of passing rapidly from one part of the Horatian corpus to another in search of passages relevant to the chosen theme makes it very difficult to place the passages in context, surely a necessary part of testing the validity of any hypothesis. B. is, however, very learned and industrious; and her use of ancient authorities, especially Cicero and Seneca, is instructive. Micaela Janan's B★★*The Politics of Desire. Propertius IV*[4] is a striking example of a brand of contemporary literary criticism which polarizes scholarly opinion. In this context, description may be more useful than judgement. Leaning heavily on the psychoanalytical studies of Lacan, J. strives to solve some traditional and some novel problems of Propertius IV. Why, for instance, is the patriotic 4.6 immediately followed by the virulent ghost of Cynthia in 4.7, and why is 4.7 immediately followed by the very much alive Cynthia of 4.8? Why, at 4.7.63–6, does Andromeda still bear the bruises from her chains (not an inescapable interpretation of the Latin), and why is Cynthia's conduct towards Propertius at 4.8.63–9 'closer to something like sadism'? Readers may find the articulation of the questions much clearer than that of the answers; in an uneven work, it was odd to find approval for the absurd proposition that 'the cave at Lanuvium [4.8.3–8] . . . represents the female genitalia while the snake represents the male' in the same chapter as a highly imaginative (though necessarily speculative) reconstruction of the religious and other motives that brought large crowds to the festival at Lanuvium. Neil Hopkinson's B★*Ovid, Metamorphoses Book XIII*[5] is a most worthy addition to what we all now call the 'green and yellow series'. Book 13 would surely figure prominently in a list of those books of the *Metamorphoses* that should be considered by those who are not going to read the whole work, so that this edition will fill a genuine need. H.'s long Introduction offers a brisk account of the *Metamorphoses* in general followed by a very full account of the literary history of each of the myths to be encountered; since few readers are likely to come to this edition with no previous exposure to the *Metamorphoses*, the balance seems entirely right. The notes are generous and fully attentive to the questions likely to be asked by today's students. This is a worthy addition to a well-respected series. A. J. Brothers's B★*Terence The Eunuch*[6] and H. M. Hine's B★*Seneca Medea*[7] are two of the most recent additions to the ever-growing Aris & Phillips series. This is the second of Terence's

https://doi.org/10.1093/gr/48.2.233 Published online by Cambridge University Press

comedies produced by B. for that series, the other being the *Self-Tormentor* of 1988. As he fulsomely acknowledges, he has been able to benefit, in this edition, from Barsby's recent Cambridge edition of the *Eunuch*. The notes are full and very clearly written and the translation reads well. This is no small achievement since it is impossible to catch the colloquial tone of Terence's language without sacrificing something of the literal meaning. B. does seem to have steered a good path here and has not been afraid to use the notes to alert the reader to the problem. H. is dealing with a more controversial author; Seneca's tragedies notoriously excite very different reactions from different readers. H.'s informative and detailed Introduction steers a most judicious course through the standard controversies but leaves the reader with the distinct impression that, in the final judgement, his sympathies lie with his author – and so they should; for an author is surely entitled to a sympathetic editor. He is judiciously agnostic on the wearying question of the staging of Senecan plays. The translation is straightforward and the notes are clear, answer the right questions and show appropriate sympathy with the author. The third edition of H. R. Fairclough's Loeb *Virgil* (Volume II, with revisions by G. P. Goold)[8] follows volume I which was reviewed by Monica Gale last year (*G&R* 47 [2000], 245). In this volume, as in the first, there are constant minor changes to translation of and footnotes to the *Aeneid*. The *Appendix Vergiliana*, however, as well as attracting constant minor changes to the translation, has been given an entirely new Introduction and Bibliography and the old Appendix (occasional notes on *Aen.* 7–12 and a very out-of-date general discussion of the *Appendix Vergiliana* in general) has been entirely deleted. The order of the various poems has also been radically altered.

D. E. HILL

NOTES

1. *Slaves, Masters and the Art of Authority in Plautine Comedy*. By Kathleen McCarthy. Princeton U.P., 2000. Pp. xiii + 231. £28.50.
2. *Virgil on the Nature of Things*. The *Georgics*, Lucretius and the Didactic Tradition. By Monica R. Gale, Cambridge U.P., 2000. Pp. xiv + 321. £40.00.
3. *Horace and the Gift Economy of Patronage*. The Joan Palevsky Imprint in Classical Literature. Classics and Contemporary Thought VII. By Phebe Lowell Bowditch. University of California Press, 2001. Pp. xi + 281. Hardback £36.50, paperback £14.95.
4. *The Politics of Desire*. Propertius IV. The Joan Palevsky Imprint in Classical Literature. By Micaela Janan. University of California Press, 2001. Pp. xi + 244. Cloth £30.00, paper £12.50.
5. *Ovid, Metamorphoses Book XIII*. Cambridge Greek and Latin Classics. Edited by Neil Hopkinson. Cambridge U.P., 2000. Pp. ix + 252, with 1 map. Hardback £40.00, paperback £14.95.
6. *Terence, The Eunuch*. Edited with Translation and Commentary by A. J. Brothers. Aris & Phillips, Warminster, 2000. Pp. vi + 213. Cloth £35.00, limp £16.50.
7. *Seneca Medea*. With an Introduction, Translation and Commentary by H. M. Hine. Aris & Phillips, Warminister, 2000. Pp. vi + 218. Cloth £35.00, limp £16.50.
8. *Virgil, Aeneid 7–12, Appendix Vergiliana*. LCL 64. Translated by H. Rushton Fairclough, revised by G. P. Goold. Harvard U.P., 2000. Pp. 590. £12.95.

Greek History

Never mind the bicycling monarchs of Europe or jogging presidents of the United States: in Sparta, kings received petitions while taking their daily bath in the river (Xenophon, *Hellenica* 5.4.28). Imagine, if it is not too distressing, standing on the

https://doi.org/10.1093/gr/48.2.233 Published online by Cambridge University Press