Syme. I sought in vain for provocative insight or thoughtful analysis. As an interpreter of Ovid's Rome, B. adds little to his black and white plates of the ruined ancient city.

Macquarie University GERALDINE HERBERT-BROWN
doi:10.1093/clrevj/bni077

PUTNAM'S PROFESSIONALS

P. THIBODEAU, H. HASKELL (edd.): *Being There Together. Essays in Honor of Michael C. J. Putnam on the Occasion of His Seventieth Birthday*. Pp. xii + 301, colour photo. Afton, MN: Afton Historical Society Press, 2003. Cased. ISBN: 1-890434-62-0.

Michael Putnam, the dedicatee of these essays, is renowned for interpretations of poetic *libri* that read each book as a whole and uncover intricate webs of cross-references. This Festschrift is hardly a *liber carminum*, but its structure is subtle indeed. One is initially hard put to perceive what the blueprint could be, reading an introduction which first charts Putnam's career up until his *Aeneid* book in 1965, then, with a reference to his work as 'one of the most extensive and influential appropriations of New Critical techniques by classicists of his generation' (p. 6), interprets a modern poem. But linear reading soon reveals all: the contributions are arranged 'by rubrics', much like the middle section of a Suetonian vita. Where we would find there a synchronic account of *res gestae*, we have here Putnam's most notable activities as teacher and scholar, each represented by a contribution which it has inspired in a former student. Since *The Poetry of the 'Aeneid'* was Putnam's first masterpiece as a classicist, its publication corresponds to the assumption of office by an emperor in Suetonius. The 'rubrics' are, then, very appropriately framed as follows: J. Gaisser introduces the Apuleius commentator filippo Beroaldo, who stands for the particularly proficient teacher, then M. Munich reconsiders the subject Putnam examined in his first major article: Catullus 64. From there we traverse the book to S. Spence's epilogue, the point of departure for her thoughts on 'Lyric Irreducibility and the Cheshire Cat' being the passage probably most often explored by Putnam: the end of the *Aeneid* (12.938–52). Immediately preceding stands a contribution with a 'symbolic' significance that will be evident to readers who know how much Putnam enjoys being in Italy or, more particularly, at the American Academy in Rome: B. Redford's informative and amusing paper about 'The Society of Dilettanti on Classical Ground', which centres on the illustrious Sir William Hamilton.

Most Festschrifts tend to produce a mixture of genuinely important essays and others that are readable, but not overly valuable in terms of research. This one is no exception. S. Tracy has almost nothing new to say about Virgil's third eclogue, not least because he failed to consult E. A. Schmidt's groundbreaking *Poetische Reflexion: Vergils Bukolik* (Munich, 1972). A. Sens, by contrast, offers a pioneering contribution towards our interpretation of poems that are too rarely examined: the epigrams in the *Anthologia Palatina*. Analysing a tribute to a poet—Asclepiades' epitaph for Erinna (28 Gow-Page)—S. shows how an epigrammatist constructs the obviously fictional portrait of a dead poet by drawing on the late subject's work. Food for thought is also served by four contributors who, as Putnam has variously done, interpret the symbolism of 'epic designs': P. Bleisch on the hitherto largely neglected ekphrasis of

The Classical Review vol. 55 no. 1 © The Classical Association 2005; all rights reserved

https://doi.org/10.1093/clrevj/bni078 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Picus' *regia* (Virg. *Aen*. 7.152–93), A. Augoustakis on Hasdrubal's cloak (Sil. *Pun*. 15.425–32) as a 'proleptic sign' (p. 113), then—complementing this nicely—R. Marks on the same text's Liternum paintings (6.660–97) and the *Iliacae pugnae* murals in Juno's temple at Carthage (*Aen*. 1.456–93), and R. Rothaus Caston's attempt to establish a link between Prop. 4.6 and *Aen*. 8.671–713. This last constitutes but a first step in the right direction, because C. identifies the elegiac persona of 4.6 with Propertius and so takes the poem much too seriously (the same applies *mutatis mutandis* to Munich's handling of Catullus' epyllion). All the more persuasive is L. Bowditch's reading of Prop. 2.10: she argues that the poet 'has cast the emperor's military conquests in the diction of elegiac eroticism' (p. 166). Conservative Propertius people will not want to hear that the sexualized Euphrates invites comparison with a *cinaedus* because *negat . . . equitem post terga tueri* (v. 13), but is this an erotic poem or not? Putnam's seminal paper 'Possessiveness, Sexuality and Heroism in the *Aeneid*', *Vergilius* 31 (1985), 1–21 also detected erotic language in battle scenes there, and S. Scully now revisits those to find more in 'Eros and Warfare in Virgil's "Aeneid" and Homer's "Iliad" '.

While S. Foley devotes only a short essay without footnotes to Tibullus' first elegy (and so cannot shed new light on this complex poem), S. Raval takes a long look at the Echo of Ovid's *Metamorphoses* (3.359–507). This is commendable, because the poor dear disappears behind Narcissus not only in the poem, but usually in scholarly studies too. However, R. founds her arguments on the textually shaky assertion that 'Echo was once an Orphic figure who had the ability to entrance her audience' (p. 205), and so this presentation of the voice-only nymph is as one-sided as the contributions by Munich and Caston, who similarly fail to take their texts' playful character into account. Putnam's alumni are better able to convince when they follow the trail he blazed in his *Aeneid* studies and analyse related works. V. Panoussi on the Massilia section in the *Pharsalia* provides new insight into Lucan's manipulation of epic topoi, e.g. of the motif 'cutting down a sacred grove'. The series of text interpretations closes with J. Whitta on 'Bernard of Clairvaux in "Paradiso" 31–33', a continuation of Putnam's own study on father-figures in Virgil and Dante ('Virgil's Inferno', *MD* 20/21 [1988], 165–202). After W. comes the paper on the Society of the Dilettanti. This includes a number of illustrations, and one of them shows Sir Bourchier Wrey clasping a punchbowl. Horace Walpole was doubtless right: 'The nominal qualification [for membership] is having been in Italy, and the real one, being drunk' (p. 258). The celebrations for Michael Putnam's seventieth birthday perhaps involved a certain amount of drinking too. But the qualification for membership in the society of professionals that put together this Festschrift was clearly the successful keeping up of scholarly traditions established by their revered teacher.

University of Munich NIKLAS HOLZBERG
doi:10.1093/clrevj/bni078

SENECA'S *THYESTES*

P. J. Davis: Seneca: *Thyestes*. (Duckworth Companions to Greek and Roman Tragedy.) Pp. 172. London: Duckworth, 2003. Paper, £10.99. ISBN: 0-7156-3222-1.

Thyestes continues to fascinate. Amid the stream of literature on Seneca's master-drama, D.'s user-friendly introduction provides a helpful point of orientation

The Classical Review vol. 55 no. 1 © The Classical Association 2005; all rights reserved

https://doi.org/10.1093/clrevj/bni078 Published online by Cambridge University Press