preconception of what the author ought to say.[8] But, as I hope to have shown, there can be too much even of theology.

St John's College, Oxford S.R.P. GERTZ
sebastian.gertz@sjc.ox.ac.uk
doi:10.1017/S0009838816000604

A FURTHER MANUSCRIPT SOURCE FOR PROCLUS' *HYMNS**

In November 2014 I had the pleasure of examining Bruxellensis 11377–80. This paper manuscript was owned by Pierre Pantin at his death in 1611; it occupies no. 30 in his catalogue, where the first text, on fols 1–4, was misidentified as 'Hymni Homeri'. The next owner, André Schott, repeated the error; Omont (and following him the Pinakes database) uses a page-numeration that completely excludes the current fols 1–4.[1]

The manuscript is composed of three parts, as follows:

1) fols 1–4 in fact contain Proclus' *Hymns* 3.12–7.52, together with Orphic fr. 31 Bernabé = 21a Kern; there are twenty-two lines per page. This source is absent from Vogt's edition, even though fols 92v–95r, which contain a further text of Proclus' *Hymns*, are included as MS 5.[2] I identified the scribe as Demetrios Moschos by his handwriting.[3] The watermark is a crossbow within a circle; the chain-lines pass just outside the circle, *c*.32 mm apart. The design is similar to Harlfinger's 'Arbalète 35', but smaller. The watermark described by Formentin from Marcianus gr. 604 fols 132–78, where Moschos copied the *Orphic Argonautica*, may offer a better match.[4] I do not know why fol. 1 is also marked '29' in a later hand.

[8] The influence of Ammonius may have played a role here too; cf. his *In Cat.* 6.6-8: μετὰ δὲ τὴν λογικὴν ἰτέον ἐπὶ τὴν ἠθικήν, καὶ οὕτως ἀντιληπτέον τῶν φυσικῶν, καὶ μετ' ἐκεῖνα τῶν μαθηματικῶν, καὶ οὕτως ἐσχάτων τῶν θεολογικῶν.

* My thanks to the University of Nottingham for funding, and to the staff of the KBR, BnF and Biblioteca Estense for assistance.

[1] See H. Omont, 'Catalogue des manuscrits grecs de la Bibliothèque Royale de Bruxelles', *Revue de l'instruction publique en Belgique* 28 (1885), 6–21, 82–9, at 88 for Pantin's catalogue, 89 for Schott's, and 7 for Omont's own description. Pinakes: http://pinakes.irht.cnrs.fr/ (accessed 28 June 2015).

[2] E. Vogt, *Procli hymni* (Wiesbaden, 1957).

[3] E. Gamillscheg and D. Harlfinger, *Repertorium der griechischen Kopisten* (Vienna, 1981-), I no. 97 = II 131 = III 165. I thank Rudolf Stefec for confirming my identification, and for alerting me to his own supplement to the list of manuscripts of Proclus' *Hymns* (Beinecke 532: 'Aus der literarischen Werkstatt des Michael Apostoles', *Jahrbuch der Österreichischen Byzantinistik* 60 [2010], 29–48, at 30).

[4] D. Harlfinger and J. Harlfinger, *Wasserzeichen aus griechischen Handschriften* (Berlin, 1974–1980). M.R. Formentin, 'Il punto su Demetrio Mosco', *Bollettino della Badia Greca di Grottaferrata* 52 (1998), 235–57, at 254. Formentin notes several encircled crossbows among the watermarks on Moschos's paper: Marcianus gr. VIII 18 and Neapolitanus III D 22 = Harlfinger 'Arbalète 32'; Parisinus gr. 2157 ~ 'Arbalète 31' and 'Arbalète 38'.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0009838816000616 Published online by Cambridge University Press

2) fols 5–30 contain the Theognidea, with twenty-four lines per page. The main watermark is a close match for Harlfinger 'Main 29' (dated *c.*1490).[5] A further watermark (fols 7/10) will be described in the next paragraph. The scribe is, I believe, the same as that of Parisinus gr. 2765 fols 39–58 (*Homeric Hymns*), which is a twin of the Bruxellensis' text of the *Homeric Hymns*. The range of scribes collaborating on the Parisinus, including Georgios Gregoropoulos and Thomas Bitzimanos, points to Apostoles' workshop, which is the source of the main part of the Bruxellensis (see below).[6]
3) fols 31–96 contain the *Homeric Hymns*, Moschus' *Amor Fugitivus*, the *Orphic Hymns* and five Proclan *Hymns* (1, 2, 3–4 run together, 5), with twenty-five lines per page. The numbering of the gatherings reverts to 1 here. This section is signed (fol. 95r) and mostly written by Aristoboulos Apostoles.[7] He signs himself as a deacon, a position that he already held in March 1489.[8] The watermark is a close match for Harlfinger 'Main 11' or 'Main 17', and related watermarks from the early 1490s.[9] The collocation with 'Main 29' (above) suggests a connection to Vaticanus gr. 1311, which Harlfinger cites for both his 'Main 11' and 'Main 29', and which was written by Aristoboulos *c.*1490.

Collating fol. 3r allowed me to locate Moschos's text of the Proclan *Hymns* in the stemma. The range and order of hymns put the manuscript within Vogt's families ε or δ, and the reading 4.1 σοφίης reduces this to ε or β (since γ, the other sub-family of δ, has σοφίαν).[10] However, sporadic readings appear to be incorporated from the O-family, which contains Plethon's idiosyncratic 'edition' of the hymns. Particularly revealing is 7.51-2:

> κέκλυθι καί μοι μείλιχον οὖας ὑπόσχες·
> χροιῆ ἀναγκαίη σὺ δέ μοι μείλιχον οὖας ὑπόσχες.

Here βε have:

> κέκλυθι, κέκλυθ' ἄνασσα· πολύλλιστος δέ σ' ἱκάνω
> χρειοῖ ἀναγκαίη· σὺ δέ μείλιχον οὖας ὑπόσχες.

For O, Plethon conflated the lines into one: κέκλυθι κέκλυθι καί μοι μείλιχον οὖας ὑπόσχες. If Moschos was conscientiously collating two manuscripts to produce his copy, he must have miscopied O for verse 51 and βε for verse 52, to produce two lines with identical second halves, rather than accepting the superior text of βε. A more likely scenario is suggested by Mutinensis Estensis α.W.5.16 (= gr. 164). This manuscript is a member of β, which Giorgio Valla copied initially in 1464/1465, before

[5] Cf. Harlfinger's slightly larger 'Mains 24–5', from around the same date.
[6] For the identified scribes of the Parisinus, see M. Cariou's entry in the online BnF manuscript catalogue: http://archivesetmanuscrits.bnf.fr/cdc.html (accessed 16 July 2015).
[7] Of the further hands (fols 84r, 87v, 88v, 94r), that on 88v is a good match for Manuel Gregoropoulos in Laurentianus 70.21 (α with strong diagonal; β like a podgy love-heart on its side; δ with long, narrow loop into the next letter; ν with a small loop off to the left instead of a lower vertex, etc.); it is less like the image of Manuel's writing in *RGrK* (see n. 3, above) I.C no. 249.
[8] For Aristoboulos's birth (recent in a letter of 1469) and deaconate, see D.J. Geanakoplos, *Greek Scholars in Venice* (Cambridge, MA, 1962), 168–9.
[9] Cf. Mains 10, 12, 18.
[10] See Vogt (n. 2), 25 for the stemma.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0009838816000616 Published online by Cambridge University Press

subsequently collating his text of the *Hymns* with a copy from the O-family.[11] Vogt assigns this manuscript siglum B, its marginalia B^2. Valla wrote in the margin to 7.51 ἢ καὶ μοι [*sic*] μείλιχον οὗας ὑπόσχες, and I believe that Moschos was misled by trying to incorporate precisely this marginal note.[12] Orphic fr. 31 also follows in B; in the margin to line 1 appears the unusual variant ἀρχικέραυνος, which Moschos incorporates. One might argue that Moschos's omission of Proclus, *H.* 6.13-15 does demonstrate direct access to an O-manuscript as well as to B^2, since (based on Vogt's information) B^2 appears not to mark those lines for deletion.[13] If this is reliable, Valla at around the time of B^2 may have been Moschos's source for both manuscripts.

That Moschos should have copied Proclus' *Hymns*, from a book owned by Valla, is no great surprise. He copied other works of Proclus in Mutinensis γ.V.4.4 and Parisinus gr. 1840; Proclus' *Hymns* are transmitted alongside Orphica, and Moschos copied the *Orphic Argonautica* in Marcianus gr. 604 and Vaticanus gr. 37, as well as writing introductory notes to the *Lithica* for Pico della Mirandola. He wrote Mutinensis α.P.5.18, which Valla owned, and he probably also knew the heir to Valla's library, Alberto Pio of Carpi.[14] Moschos's life is too obscure for us to specify the circumstances of copying, but if I may hazard a speculation it would be based on two facts about Pico. The first is that Pico wrote to Valla in May 1492 asking to borrow B (though his stated interest there was Callimachus' *Hymns*).[15] The second is that Pico, according to catalogues of his library made after it passed to Domenico Grimani, owned a book containing three of Proclus' *Hymns*—a unique quantity, as far as I know.[16] It may be that the catalogues' 'three' was a mistake. However, Pico's book, in which the range of texts is not matched elsewhere, presumably had multiple sources. Hence it is conceivable that Moschos copied the *Orphic Argonautica* and *Hymns* and Proclus' *Hymns* for Pico, using Valla's copy; the last couple of pages went astray, so that this text contained only *Hymns* 1.1-3.11, which were later bound with the *Homeric Hymns*, Musaeus and Aratus from other sources. The errant pages of Proclus somehow ended up in the Bruxellensis, alongside texts from Apostoles' Cretan workshop, with which Moschos is known to have had dealings via Venice in the 1490s.[17] My speculation is, admittedly,

[11] The date is secured by the watermark and by Constantine Lascaris's correction of Valla's signature: see O. Thomas, 'Homeric and/or Hymns: some fifteenth-century approaches', forthcoming in A. Faulkner, A. Vergados and A. Schwab (edd.), *The Reception of the Homeric Hymns* (Oxford).

[12] Many of B's marginalia were copied by Michael Souliardos into Ambrosianus 11 (A63sup.), but the Bruxellensis matches B's title for hymns 4 and 6 rather than those of the Ambrosianus.

[13] Another notable alignment with O—7.41 κῦρμα—could be Moschos's correction: B has κῦμα, B^2 the gloss συντυχία. Moschos attempted several other corrections, e.g. 7.38 ἐρέχθομαι for ἐρίχθομαι, 43 γυίοις (γύλοις β, om. O).

[14] See Formentin (n. 4). The pages of the Bruxellensis have a different column-length from both Marcianus and Vaticanus; there is no reason to think they ever belonged with either.

[15] J.L. Heiberg, *Beiträge zur Geschichte Georg Valla's und seiner Bibliothek* (*Centrallblatt für Bibliothekswesen*, Beiheft 16) (Leipzig, 1896), 46, 61.

[16] A. Diller, L.G. Westerink and H.D. Saffrey, *Bibliotheca graeca manuscripta cardinalis Dominici Grimani (1461–1523)* (Venice, 2003), no. 110; as a paper copy of the *Orphic Argonautica*, this is identifiable with P. Kibre, *The Library of Pico della Mirandola* (New York, 1936), no. 150.

[17] G. Speake and F. Vian, 'The so-called D-manuscripts of Apollonius', *GRBS* 14 (1973), 301–18, at 309; Formentin (n. 4), 238.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0009838816000616 Published online by Cambridge University Press

only one possibility; since Pico's book was probably destroyed in a fire in 1687, it is hard to see how it could be confirmed. And so I leave matters there.

University of Nottingham OLIVER THOMAS
oliver.thomas@nottingham.ac.uk
doi:10.1017/S0009838816000616

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0009838816000616 Published online by Cambridge University Press