'Attested Women Writers of the Graeco-Roman World' would have been even more helpful if it provided a complete list of attestations.

P.'s collection comes at an opportune moment. The continuing need for basic works of compensatory history has been made clear by a recent article that disentombs the old desire to explain away Sulpicia as merely a pseudonym used by Tibullus (and others): 'That the only two Roman poetesses we know much about should both be named 'Sulpicia' is too much of a coincidence to be accidental' (T. K. Hubbard, 'The Invention of Sulpicia', *CJ* 101 [2005], 177–94 at 188). Perhaps P.'s book might help the author and others know much more about Roman 'poetesses'.

University of Cincinnati HOLT PARKER
doi:10.1093/clrevj/bni267

UNCAGING THE MUSES

P. MURRAY, P. WILSON (edd.): *Music and the Muses. The Culture of 'Mousikê' in the Classical Athenian City*. Pp. xiv + 438, ills. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004. Cased, £65. ISBN: 0-19-924239-9.

The same anecdote appears three times in this volume: a Spartan ephor refused the musician Timotheos permission to play at state festivals unless he cut off the extra string he had added to the properly seven-stringed lyre. The incident encompasses the different strands brought together in this rich, varied and frequently innovative treatment of *mousikê*, a term including instrumental music, the poetic word, and the synchronized movements of the dance, in the classical and post-classical Greek world. As the episode reveals, the realm of the Muses could not be divorced from the religious, social, and political contexts in which musical performances belonged. How you played, what you played, and the instrument on which you played turn out to reveal cultural mores, practices, and tensions within fifth-century society. It is this broader dimension that the authors of the work seek to reinsert into a field that, they argue, has been falsely atomized and too often studied in isolation.

The work's opening four chapters offer the most densely informative portion of the collection. Here literary, epigraphic, and visual evidence are brought together to support the view that song, music, and dance played a central rôle in Greek religious practices from archaic through to imperial times. Alex Hardie demonstrates the centrality of aural experience in mystery religions: what the initiate heard through the course of the rite as well as how s/he sang and danced proved critical to achieving that proximity to the divine that the cults promoted. The cosmic and eschatological teachings of the mystery religions were also expounded through musical analogies and through actual poetic performances. Barbara Kowalzig's contribution argues that changing Athenian choral practices and the chorus's relocation to the dramatic arena where Dionysus uniquely presides stand at odds with Greek polytheism, which demands the individual worship of each god and goddess. In his account of the rôle of dance and song in Athenian *theōria*, Ian Rutherford painstakingly documents the various forms musical performances might take through the course of these pilgrimages/embassies. He reaches the not surprising conclusion that theoric choruses sought to project an image of civic unity and coherence before an audience of strangers. But this, he further points out, stands in marked contrast to choral performances within Athens, which rather reflect intra-polis divisions. Closing this part of the volume is Paola Ceccarelli's exemplary 'thick' description of the *pyrrhichê*,

The Classical Review vol. 55 no. 2 © The Classical Association 2005; all rights reserved

https://doi.org/10.1093/clrevj/bni268 Published online by Cambridge University Press

a dance whose meaning she elucidates by considering its aetiology and the contexts in which it was performed. Transition rituals and the individual's reintegration into the community emerge as the perhaps too generalized motifs that run consistently through the different occasions.

Think music and dance in ancient Athens and the theatre of Dionysus inevitably comes to mind. Three authors address *mousikê* as enacted on the tragic and comic stages. Eva Stehle expands existing work on the interface between tragedy and ritual by arguing that tragic choruses must be read against the place of *choreia* within conventional religious rites. Only then does the degree of distortion and the marked departures from normative choral practices (where, for example, avoidance of *dusphêmeia* is among the rules of the day) become clear. Claude Calame's contribution switches the focus to comedy and, characteristic of this author, adds a linguistic and anthropological perspective to the question of what authority was invested in the comic choral voice. Particularly illuminating are his comments on how the closing of several comedies involves a multiplication of meta-theatrical references, including allusions to the author's hoped-for victory in the dramatic *agôn*. Deliberately provocative is Andrew Barker's reading of the nightingale in Aristophanes' *Birds*; for him the bird is nothing less than the dramatist's highly critical and parodic representation of the 'New Music', figured in the person of something that looks remarkably like the low-class female piper-cum-prostitute.

Eric Csapo's article both expands the scope of Barker's contribution and initiates the third portion of the work, given over to discussions of the political dimension of fifth-century *mousikê*. Outstanding for its suggestive quality, Csapo's review of available evidence concerning musical innovation shows how the playing of the flute and the lyre came to furnish a weapon in the hands of critics of the late fifth-century Athenian democracy. By exploring the vocabulary used of the new musical modes (whose novel instrumental, performative and linguistic components Csapo richly treats) the author shows how closely terms indicative of heterogeneity, liberation and change coincide with those used by those malcontent with the political scene. Harness this to existing dichotomies between Greek and barbarian, male and female, oligarch and democrat, and a powerful set of associations appears. As the article shows, much of our own view of the New Music results from an entirely fictitious and élitist fifth-century construct, which posited the existence of an idealized, timeless musical mode rooted in the Dorian tradition. Much narrower in focus, but equally pertinent to the mesh between politics and music, is Robert Wallace's discussion of Damon of Oa. From the piecemeal evidence, he offers a persuasive account of the reasons why a seemingly armchair musicologist would be singled out for ostracism from mid fifth-century Athens. So central was *mousikê* to the socialization of the citizen and to his participation in the city's military enterprises that musical theorizing and change becomes a potential source of distortion and disturbance within the political and social order. Such shifting ground is very much the territory of Peter Wilson's article, a convincing use of a new historicist approach. Building on his earlier exploration of the cultural significance of the *aulos*, Wilson now turns his attention to the string section. As he moves beyond the familiar distinction between the pipes and lyre, he complicates the picture by documenting how the kithara lost its seemingly inevitable association with the Athenian élite. Increased professionalism and competitive performances attended by mass audiences meant a devaluation of the instrument. Nothing better exemplifies the trend than a late fifth-century vase image showing the kithara in the hands of Marsyas, the satyr whose original appropriation of the *aulos*, and subsequent competition with Apollo had placed him outside the realm of

https://doi.org/10.1093/clrevj/bni268 Published online by Cambridge University Press

stringed instruments and beyond the aristocratic pale. Here Wilson also treats the relation of a series of the leading politicians to the flute and its deployment as a tool of image-formation and policy-projection.

In the fourth and final section, two articles offer close readings of texts centrally concerned with *mousikê*, its theory and practice. Andrew Ford sets out to restore the term to its proper significance in Book 8 of Aristotle's *Politics*. Where others try to slot *mousikê* into the philosopher's broader ideas on the place of literature and poetry within the state, Ford shows how a more narrow, 'musical' interpretation yields other insights. For Aristotle and his programme for the education and formation of citizens, music's acoustic and physiological powers offer a central tool. Somatic responses to music and dance also figure in Victoria Wohl's discussion of the 'dirty dancing' at the close of Xenophon's *Symposium*. In her account, the text's final portions stage an *agôn* between the dance Socrates earlier performed (an attempt not merely to reduce his girth but also part of his articulation of an 'ouranian' view of eros) and the Syracusan dance-master's own lascivious performance. Much in the way that Alcibiades' 'encomion' of Socrates at the end of Plato's *Symposium* challenges the earlier speech of Socrates/Diotima, so too this titillating representation undermines the seemingly persuasive account of love the philosopher earlier supplied. The collection ends with a fitting question: which are the specific activities over which the Muses, seemingly undisputed goddesses of *mousikê* in all its manifestations, preside? Poetry certainly, but, as Penelope Murray shows, not every form of literary activity or intellectual pursuit. While Plato places prose philosophizing under the goddesses' aegis, rhetoricians, practitioners of something viewed as a *technê*, can do without divine inspiration. The Hellenistic Mouseion turns out to prove a misnomer: with music now excluded from the study of literature, and marked off as a pursuit separate from education and culture, the Muses find themselves consigned to a silent cage.

It is the merit of this work to have opened this cage, both exploring its lesser-known corners and placing it squarely within the context of the classical and post-classical Greek *polis*.

Columbia University DEBORAH STEINER
doi:10.1093/clrevj/bni268

MUSICAL TERMINOLOGY

E. Rocconi: *Le parole delle muse. La formazione del lessico tecnico musicale nella Grecia antica.* (Quaderni dei Seminari Romani di Cultura Greca 5.) Pp. viii + 147. Rome: Edizione Quasar, 2003. Paper. ISBN: 88-7140-245-6.

This is a useful, if circumscribed, study of the emergence from ordinary Greek vocabulary of a more technical musical vocabulary. It by no means covers the whole range of technical terminology, as the subtitle might be taken to suggest. The topics discussed in the work's three chapters are: terms connected with the tuning and playing of stringed instruments; language used in the perception, classification, and evaluation of sounds; and the application to music of certain words customarily used for animal noises.

R. takes her start from the observation that specialist terminologies develop from the 'risemantizzazione di termini propri della lingua d'uso'. The basic terms for the degrees of the scale (ὑπάτη, λιχανός, etc.) derive directly from the physical

The Classical Review vol. 55 no. 2 © The Classical Association 2005; all rights reserved

https://doi.org/10.1093/clrevj/bni268 Published online by Cambridge University Press