STUDIES IN CHURCH HISTORY

VOLUME 52

DOUBTING CHRISTIANITY: THE CHURCH AND DOUBT

EDITED BY FRANCES ANDREWS, CHARLOTTE METHUEN and ANDREW SPICER

For the Ecclesiastical History Society
CAMBRIDGE

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Studies in Church History

52

(2016)

DOUBTING CHRISTIANITY: THE CHURCH AND DOUBT

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

DOUBTING CHRISTIANITY: THE CHURCH AND DOUBT

EDITED BY

FRANCES ANDREWS

CHARLOTTE METHUEN

ANDREW SPICER

PUBLISHED FOR
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY
BY
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
2016

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

© Ecclesiastical History Society 2016

Published by Cambridge University Press
on behalf of the Ecclesiastical History Society
University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

This publication is subject to copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provision of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of the copyright holder.

First published 2016

ISBN 978-1-107-18073-4

ISSN 0424–2084

Bible quotations are taken from the following versions:

Revised Standard Version, copyright © 1946, 1952 and 1971 the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America. Used by permission. All rights reserved.

The 21st Century King James Version, copyright © 1994 by Deuel Enterprises, Inc., Gary, SD 57237, USA. All rights reserved.

New International Version®, NIV®, copyright © 1973, 1978, 1984, 2011 by Biblica, Inc.® Used by permission. All rights reserved worldwide.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: *Studies in Church History* is an annual subscription journal (ISSN 0424–2084). The 2016 subscription price (excluding VAT), which includes print and electronic access, is £95 (US $152 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions and £55 (US $88 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals ordering direct from the Press and certifying that the volume is for their personal use. An electronic-only subscription is also available to institutions at £75 (US $120 in the USA, Canada and Mexico). Special arrangements exist for members of the Ecclesiastical History Society.

Previous volumes are available online at www.journals.cambridge.org/StudCH

Printed in the United Kingdom by Bell & Bain Ltd
A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Contents

Preface ix
List of Contributors xi
List of Abbreviations xiii
List of Illustrations xv

Introduction 1
Frances Andrews

Doubting John? (*Presidential Address*) 17
Frances Andrews

'The very deceitfulness of devils': Firmilian and the Doubtful Baptisms of a Woman possessed by Demons 49
Charlotte Methuen

Carolingian Doubt? 65
Jinty Nelson

'*Sancte fidei omnino deiciar*': Ugolino dei Conti di Segni's Doubts and Jacques de Vitry's Intervention 87
Jan Vandeburie

Diabolical Doubt: The Peculiar Account of Brother Bernard's Demonic Possession in Jordan of Saxony's *Libellus* 102
Steven Watts

Lachrymose Holiness and the Problem of Doubt in Thirteenth- and Fourteenth-Century Hagiographies 118
Kimberley-Joy Knight

Heresy, Doubt and Identity: Late Medieval Friars in the Kingdom of Aragon 135
Emily E. Graham

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

The Doubting Augustine: The Deletion of Monica from Fourteenth-Century *Vitae Augustini* in the Augustinian Order of Hermits 150
Anik Laferrière

Trust and Doubt: The Late Medieval Bishop and Local Knowledge 164
Ian Forrest

Dubius in fide fidelis est? Doubt and Assurance in Late Medieval Catholicism 186
Robert N. Swanson

Doubting Witchcraft: Theologians, Jurists, Inquisitors during the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries 203
Matteo Duni

'Dowting of ye Cupp': Disbelief about the Eucharist and a Catholic Miracle in Reformation England 232
Alexandra Walsham

Theological Doubt and Institutional Certainty: An Anglican Paradox 250
Rowan Williams

Unbelief, the Senses and the Body in Nicholas Bownde's *The vnbeleefe of S. Thomas* (1608) 266
Patrick S. McGhee

Proving Stigmata: Antonio Daza, Saint Francis of Assisi and Juana de la Cruz 283
Cordelia Warr

Doubt, Anxiety and Protestant Epistolary Counselling: The Letter-Book of Nehemiah Wallington 298
Lucy Busfield

Polemicist as Pastor: Daniel Featley's Anti-Catholic Polemic and Countering Lay Doubt in England during the early 1620s 315
Greg Salazar

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

'Perhaps he cannot know': John Wesley's Use of Doubt as a Principle of his 'Catholic Spirit' 331
Kelly Diehl Yates

'[T]he extirpation of Athanasianism': The Considerable Doubts of Francis Stone (1738–1813) 347
Colin Haydon

Christian Doubt and Hope in Early Socialism 364
Philip Lockley

'Isaiah's Call to England': Doubts about Prophecy in Nineteenth-Century Britain 381
Gareth Atkins

'Telling Lies on behalf of the Bible': S. R. Gardiner's Doubts about Catholic Apostolic Teaching 398
Tim Grass

Reforming the Religious Sonnet: Poetry, Doubt and the Church in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries 413
Kirstie Blair

Doubt, our modern Crown of Thorns 437
Charles M. Stang

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Preface

The fifty-second volume of Studies in Church History takes as its theme *Doubting Christianity: The Church and Doubt*. It presents the plenary papers and a selection of the communications delivered at the Summer Conference of the Ecclesiastical History Society held under the presidency of Frances Andrews at the University of Sheffield in July 2014 and the Winter Meeting hosted by Dr Williams's Library, London, in January 2015.

The theme of doubt has proved a very fruitful area of engagement, and we would like to thank Professor Andrews for her choice of this topic and for her focused leadership as President during a period of change for the Society. Thanks are due to the authors of the essays published here, to those who acted as peer reviewers, to those who chaired communications sessions, and to all those who attended and contributed to the discussion. We are particularly grateful to Dr Tim Grass for his continuing efficient and eagle-eyed work as Assistant Editor, and to the Ecclesiastical History Society for funding his post.

The success of the Summer Conference and Winter Meeting owed much to the Society's Conference Secretary, Professor Michael Walsh, supported by the conference team at the University of Sheffield and the staff of Dr Williams's Library. To them all, thanks are also due.

In 2014, Dr Stella Fletcher stood down as Secretary of the Ecclesiastical History Society, a post which she had taken up in 2005. On behalf of the Society, we would like to thank Stella for her long and dedicated work in this role.

This is the first volume of Studies in Church History to appear as a Cambridge University Press journal. We would like to express our gratitude to Peter Clifford, Michael Middeke and all at Boydell & Brewer for their support over the past nineteen years, and to them and to Daniel Pearce, Alison Fox, Corinna McCorristine and the rest of the team at CUP for helping us to achieve a smooth transition. We are delighted to announce that the whole run of SCH is now available digitally

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

(at http://journals.cambridge.org/action/displayJournal?jid=stc) as well as in hard copy.

Charlotte Methuen
University of Glasgow

Andrew Spicer
Oxford Brookes University

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Contributors

Frances Andrews (*President*)
Professor in Mediaeval History, University of St Andrews

Gareth Atkins
Postdoctoral Research Fellow, Centre for Research in Arts, Social Science and Humanities, University of Cambridge

Kirstie Blair
Professor of English Studies, University of Stirling

Lucy Busfield
Postgraduate student, St John's College, Oxford

Matteo Duni
Professor of History, Syracuse University in Florence

Ian Forrest
Associate Professor of Later Medieval History, University of Oxford

Emily E. Graham
Assistant Professor, History Department, Oklahoma State University

Tim Grass
Senior Research Fellow, Spurgeon's College, London

Colin Haydon
Sometime Reader in Early Modern History, University of Winchester

Kimberley-Joy Knight
Postdoctoral Research Fellow, University of Sydney

Anik Laferrière
Postgraduate student, Keble College, Oxford

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Philip Lockley
Anglican ordinand, Cranmer Hall, Durham University

Patrick S. McGhee
Postgraduate student, University of Cambridge

Charlotte Methuen
Senior Lecturer in Church History, University of Glasgow

Jinty Nelson
Emeritus Professor of Medieval History, King's College London

Greg Salazar
Postgraduate student, Selwyn College, Cambridge

Charles M. Stang
Professor of Early Christian Thought, Harvard Divinity School

Robert N. Swanson
Professor of Medieval Ecclesiastical History, University of Birmingham

Jan Vandeburie
Leverhulme Abroad Postdoctoral Research Fellow, Dipartimento di Studi Umanistici, Università degli Studi Roma Tre

Alexandra Walsham
Professor of Modern History, University of Cambridge

Cordelia Warr
Senior Lecturer in Art History, University of Manchester

Steven Watts
Postgraduate student, University of St Andrews

Rowan Williams
Master of Magdalene College, Cambridge

Kelly Diehl Yates
Postgraduate student, University of Manchester

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

ActaSS	*Acta sanctorum*, ed. J. Bolland and G. Henschen (Antwerp etc., 1643–)
AFH	*Archivum Franciscanum Historicum* (1908–)
AFP	*Archivum fratrum praedicatorum* (1931–)
ANF	Ante-Nicene Fathers, ed. A. Roberts and J. Donaldson, 10 vols (Buffalo, NY, 1885–96 and subsequent edns)
BL	British Library
BN	Bibliothèque nationale de France
Bodl.	Bodleian Library
CChr.CM	Corpus Christianorum, continuatio medievalis (Turnhout, 1966–)
CChr.SL	Corpus Christianorum, series Latina (Turnhout, 1953–)
CChr.T	Corpus Christianorum in Translation (Turnhout, 2010–)
CERS	Church of England Record Society
ChH	*Church History* (1932–)
CICan	*Corpus iuris canonici*, ed. E. Richter and E. Friedberg, 2 vols (Leipzig, 1879–81)
CYS	Canterbury and York Society
DBI	*Dizionario biografico degli italiani* (Rome, 1960–)
DNB	*Dictionary of National Biography*, 63 vols (London, 1885–1900)
EETS	Early English Text Society
EHR	*English Historical Review* (1886–)
EME	*Early Medieval Europe* (1992–)
ET	English translation
FOTC	The Fathers of the Church: A New Translation (Washington DC, 1947–)
FS	*Franciscan Studies* (1941–)
HistJ	*Historical Journal* (1958–)
HThR	*Harvard Theological Review* (1908–)
JAAR	*Journal of the American Academy of Religion* (1967–)
JECS	*Journal of Early Christian Studies* (1993–)
JEH	*Journal of Ecclesiastical History* (1950–)
JMedH	*Journal of Medieval History* (1975–)
JRH	*Journal of Religious History* (1960–)
LMA	London Metropolitan Archive

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

LPL	Lambeth Palace Library
MedS	*Mediaeval Studies* (1939–)
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica inde ab a. c. 500 usque ad a. 1500, ed. G. H. Pertz et al. (Hanover, Berlin, etc., 1826–)
MGH Capit.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Capitularia regum Francorum (1883–)
MGH Conc.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Concilia (1893–)
MGH Epp.	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Epistolae (1887–)
MGH Quellen	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters (1955–)
MGH S	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores, 29 vols (1826–94)
MGH Schriften	Schriften der Monumenta Germaniae Historica (1938–)
MGH SRM	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum (1884–1951)
MGH SS	Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores (in folio) (1826–)
n.d.	no date
n.pl.	no place
NPNF I	*A Select Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church*, ed. P. Schaff, 14 vols (New York, 1887–92 and subsequent edns)
ODNB	*Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, ed. H. C. G. Matthew and Brian Harrison (Oxford, 2004)
os	old series
P&P	*Past and Present* (1952–)
PBA	*Proceedings of the British Academy* (1904–)
PG	Patrologia Graeca, ed. J.-P. Migne, 161 vols (Paris, 1857–66)
PL	Patrologia Latina, ed. J.-P. Migne, 217 vols + 4 index vols (Paris, 1844–65)
SC	Sources Chrétiennes (Paris, 1941–)
SCH	Studies in Church History
s.n.	*sub nomine* ('under the name')
Speculum	*Speculum: A Journal of Medieval Studies* (1925–)
s.v.	*sub verbo* ('under the word')
TRHS	*Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* (1871–)
VC	*Vigiliae Christianae* (1947–)

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Frances Andrews, 'Doubting John?'

Fig. 1. Giusto de' Menabuoi, *The Baptist in prison debates with his disciples*, Padua, Cathedral Baptistery. Reproduced by courtesy of the Museo Diocesano Padua. 25

Fig. 2. BNCF *conventi soppressi* A 9 1738, fol. 39^{v}, an elegant, rubricated example of the format of these dispute texts, allowing the reader to track and easily separate arguments and counter-arguments (Note the final rubric: 'Quod Iohannes Baptista non sit saluus …'). 45

Jinty Nelson, 'Carolingian Doubt?'

Fig. 1. Ivory panel, Aachen, early ninth century, Domschatzkammer, Inv.-Nr. G 8, reproduced in Frank Pohle and Peter van den Brink, eds, *Karl Charlemagne der Grosse*, Kurzführer (Dresden, 2014), 106, panel top left. Reproduced by permission of the Domschatzkammer, Aachen. 84

Fig. 2. Ivory Diptych, probably Trier, late tenth century, Bode Museum, Berlin, on Wikimedia Commons, online at: <http://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Trier_10_Jh_Diptychon_Moses_Thomas.jpg>, last accessed 29 May 2015. 85

Alexandra Walsham, 'Dowting of ye Cupp': Disbelief about the Eucharist and a Catholic Miracle in Reformation England

Fig. 1. The Bosworth Hall burse, photograph from the Bernard Payne Papers, Ushaw College, Durham, UC/P14/1/24-29. Reproduced by permission of Durham University Library. 233

Fig. 2. Fifteenth-century print of the Mass of St Gregory by Israhel van Meckenhem, British Museum Department of Prints and Drawings, E, 1.112AN52735001. © The Trustees of the British Museum. 243

Fig. 3. Defaced stone reredos of the Mass of St Gregory, Bishop Oldham's chapel, Exeter Cathedral, 1513. Reproduced by permission of the Dean and Chapter of Exeter Cathedral. 244

https://doi.org/10.1017/stc.2015.28 Published online by Cambridge University Press