Comment: *Is the Reformation over?*

The annual Père Marquette Lecture, established to commemorate the seventeenth-century French Jesuit missionary Jacques Marquette at the university in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, that also bears his name, is among the most prestigious in the English-speaking Catholic theological world. The lectures deal with a topic about which, to judge by published work, the lecturer must have been thinking for years: Lonergan on 'Doctrinal Pluralism', Lindbeck on 'Infallibility', Avery Dulles on 'Church Membership', etc.

Geoffrey Wainwright, a Methodist from the West Riding of Yorkshire, who has taught in the United States for many years (now at Duke University, South Carolina), has contributed greatly to several different ecumenical ventures. He chaired the final edition of *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry* (Lima 1982), perhaps the most important document ever produced by the World Council of Churches.

Is the Reformation over? Catholics and Protestants at the Turn of the Millennia (Marquette University Press, 91 pages, $15.00) opens ny considering the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification signed in Augsburg, Bavaria, on 31 October 1999, between representatives of the Lutheran World Federation and the Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity. Justification of the unrighteous by faith alone, as Professor Wainwright notes, is regarded by Lutherans as the *articulus stantis et cadentis ecclesiae*, the doctrine by which the Church stands or falls (a phrase Luther himself may never have used). It is also a doctrine which Catholics are happy to sign up to (now that, since Vatican II, we don't feel driven to contradict *everything* Protestants say) —though of course not as the one and only criterion that determines the ecclesial status of a community (we would be as interested, indeed more interested, in such criteria as, say, eucharistic doctrine or the authority of the Bishop of Rome).

Even more troubling, Wainwright says, there is something odd about an agreement in which the Catholics are allowed to gloss justification solely by God's grace in terms of our 'co-operating' in preparing as well as accepting justification (scare quotes in the document), justification understood as 'itself an effect of grace, not as an action arising from innate human activities' (as if!). The Lutheran gloss, on the same agreed text, declares that human beings are 'incapable of cooperating in their salvation, because as sinners they actively oppose God and his saving action'. Here, it surely seems, there is 'a distinct awkwardness', as Wainwright says, perhaps with a trace of

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1741-2005.2001.tb01762.x Published online by Cambridge University Press

English understatement, given that Catholics go on employing the word 'cooperate' affirmatively (albeit in scare quotes) while Lutherans firmly exclude it (albeit allowing that believers are 'fully involved personally' in their being justified by God's grace alone).

Professor Wainwright sketches the history of the ecumenical movement from the World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh in 1910. Autobiographically, he notes his own involvement with Catholics, first in discussions set up by some English Benedictines studying at Fribourg in 1963-64 when he was at Bossey.

The four theological (re)discoveries that have 'begun to unlock some genuine and substantial controversies' are as follows: the notion of *gospel* in Vatican II's *Dei Verbum*, overcoming the supposed Scripture versus tradition opposition; *anamnesis*, memorial, enabling us to rethink what happens in the eucharist; *koinonia*, communion, bringing us together in the doctrine of the Trinity and allowing for a certain 'spiritual ecumenism'; and 'trajectory' (Wainwirght's term), in the sense of our being able to see how and why figures like Peter and Mary have come to be much more significant than the New Testament texts on their own would suggest.

Turning to the encyclical *Ut Unum Sint* (1995), Geoffrey Wainwright examines the five problem areas listed there by Pope John Paul II. As regards three of these, Scripture and Tradition, the Eucharist, and even Mary, a certain convergence is perceptible, as just mentioned. As regards the other two, ordination and Magisterium, the prospects are much less sanguine. To these difficulties Wainwright adds two of his own. Purgatory: the Catholic Church teaches that most of us need a further period of cleansing beyond death whereas for Protestants believers are ready for final judgment. Secondly, much more work needs to be done on moral teaching.

Is the Reformation over? — the answer cannot be 'a resounding "No"', Geoffrey Wainwright thinks, since that would be untrue to the considerable ecumenical achievement of the last hundred years; yet it is 'impossible to return a simple answer of "Yes"'. It is high time, he argues in conclusion, for 'a reinvigoration of the ecumenical movement such as John Paul II sought to inspire in his encyclical *Ut Unum Sint*'. The initiative, he implies, has passed to the Bishop of Rome, whose predecessor, in the encyclical *Mortalium Animos*, back in 1928, deplored and condemned the very idea of ecumenism. Even if the Reformation is not over, Catholics have learned something.

F.K.

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1741-2005.2001.tb01762.x Published online by Cambridge University Press