CONTENTS

Acknowledgements xiv

Introduction 1

I.1 Failure in Public Law 1

I.2 Methodology 8

I.3 Perspectives and Building Blocks 14

I.4 Outline 17

PART I **Foundations**

1 **What Are Arguments from Failure and When Might We Need Them?** 23

1.1 'If men were angels. . .' 24

1.2 Necessity and Effectiveness in Public Law 30

1.3 Conclusion 40

2 **Safe, Legal and Rare: The Case for and Against Arguments from Failure** 41

2.1 Normative Stakes 42

2.2 Theoretical Resources 45

2.3 Discussion 54

2.4 Working Out a Framework 60

2.5. Conclusion 70

3 **Proportionality** 72

3.1 Introduction 72

3.2 Proportionality 76

3.3 Summary 84

3.4 Case Study: The British Post Office Scandal 85

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 16 Nov 2026 at 07:44:23, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009646659

PART II Courts

4 Structural Reform Litigation in Domestic Courts 93
4.1 Introduction 93
4.2 Structural Reform Litigation in the United States 96
4.3 Structural Reform Litigation Beyond the United States 110
4.4 Conclusion 126

5 A Framework for Structural Reform Litigation 128
5.1 Introduction 128
5.2 Stakes of the Argument 130
5.3 Core Requirements 132
5.4 Proportionality or: Conceptualizing Institutional Failure in Structural Reform Cases 138
5.5 Disagreements 153
5.6 Conclusion 158

6 Failure and Legal Innovation: Arguments from Failure as Judicial Trumps 159
6.1 Introduction 159
6.2 Deference and Failure 161
6.3 Evaluating Arguments from Failure 164
6.4 Climate Change Litigation 171
6.5 Conclusion 180

PART III International and European Perspectives

7 Arguments from Failure in International Law 183
7.1 Introduction 183
7.2 Failure in International Law 185
7.3 Evaluating Arguments from Failure in International Law 192
7.4 Conclusion 202

8 Efficiency and Failure in the European Union 203
8.1 Introduction 203
8.2 Flexibility and *Effet Utile* in European Law 205
8.3 Fundamental Rights Protection in a Multilevel System: Mutual Trust and Its Limitations 210
8.4 Questions and Lessons 218
8.5 Conclusion 229

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 16 Nov 2026 at 07:44:23, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009646659

Conclusion and Perspectives 231
9.1 Summary 231
9.2 Challenges 234
9.3 Perspectives 238

Bibliography 241
Index 265

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 16 Nov 2026 at 07:44:23, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009646659