in using paraphrases (e.g. 'the priests who watch the birds'), while the bulk of the references to augurs was *per comparationem*, using derivatives of *οἰωνός* or *ὄρνις*. *Μάντις*, also found frequently, is more problematic because of its generic nature. In this connection, V. displays responsible acumen in sorting out the sparse testimonia, both Greek and Roman, that suggest the occurrence of *auspicatio* and *immolatio* before meetings of the Senate. At the same time, it is clear that nuances such as *auspicia impetrativa* and *oblativa* were lost on Greek authors, or the authors felt they would be lost on their audience; a discussion of these alternatives, and of the presumed audience, would have added perspective.

This all the more so as the next chapter on the augurs and their *disciplina* takes up issues that are confusing or inconsistent enough in our Latin sources, such as the *rex sacrorum*, the *auguraculum*, augury (performed by Romulus and Numa) before there were augurs, and the sacred chickens. V. spends considerable time trying to make some sense of the muddled references to the augural procedures for the installation of the kings. Since make-believe, however, is endemic to the regal tradition, one may wonder whether that is worth the effort, especially since Dionysius does not have a grip on many of the augural facts anyway, as V. documents throughout his study. Dio was different: he showed, for instance, interest in priestly elections, and some of his testimonia are helpful for problems such as the deposition of augurs (it could not be done) and some of Caesar's actions that required augural consultation.

The last chapter deals with the public auspices and the question of the tribunician auspices. Once more, it is clear that Dionysius did not get it and elides crucial details due, in part, to his preference for generic terminology. V. usefully compares the Greek and Latin accounts of augural *vitia*, such as that of the elder Tiberius Gracchus and the augural machinations of Caesar and Bibulus in 59 B.C.; the Greek sources do provide complementary information. As for the auspices taken by the tribunes, V. offers a useful clarification of *templum*.

'On the whole', V. states in the final paragraph of his conclusion, 'I have not found the present subject an easy one'. Neither did the ancients, including the Romans. A contributing factor can be cited: by the time of Octavian's accession the augural system was receding in importance and writers of the imperial period could hardly be expected to pay much attention to it.

*University of Texas at Austin* KARL GALINSKY

## PAGANS IN PALESTINE

N. BELAYCHE: *Iudaea Palaestina. The Pagan Cults in Roman Palestine (Second to Fourth Century)*. Pp. xxiv + 386, ills. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001. Cased, DM 178. ISBN: 3-16-147153-9.

This book forms part of a *dossier d'habilitation* (three volumes), translated from the French. This volume concentrates on the pagan cults of Roman Palestine, often neglected by scholars in favour of the two major monotheistic religions, Judaism and Christianity.

Belayche's twelve-page preface to the work is invaluable, for it impresses on the reader the need to put Roman Palestine into context: 'a Roman province to study as a Roman province'. All too frequently modern works use the terminology Holy Land or

© The Classical Association, 2003

https://doi.org/10.1093/cr/53.1.206 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Eretz Israel, which automatically conjures up a picture of a predominantly Jewish or monotheistic province. As B. points out, the wealth of pagan material to be seen in the archaeological rooms of the Israel Museum reflect a very different picture of Palestine during the periods after the two revolts against Rome.

After the Bar Kokhba revolt (A.D.132–5), studies in the religious history of the province become rarer and the emphasis is concentrated upon the development of Judaism. The development of paganism and the relationship between pagans and Jews is inevitably seen from the Jewish perspective. This work studies pagan religious life on its own merits, and the relationship to Jewish religion is viewed from the pagan perspective.

On p. 10 the author sets out her agenda, the purpose of which is to analyse pagan practices in the province in detail. The methodological framework is also outlined, giving the reader the necessary background information to help assimilate the topics that are discussed in the following chapters.

The introduction defines in some detail the criteria for the definition of territories and the geo-strategic situation at the end of the second century A.D. with a useful and comprehensive collection of maps. The evidence from numismatics and the status of the iconographic representations is also commented on. B. comments on the discriminatory use of iconographic themes found in either villa or synagogue decoration, making the point that the acanthus and vine borders could match perfectly the refined lifestyle of the Graeco-Roman well-to-do person, or the Jew. The introduction is well thought out, providing the reader with a composite picture of a pagan province influenced by many diverse cultural aspects, both local and foreign.

Chapter 1 begins on p. 49 and examines the cultural rôle of the army in the spread of pagan cults into the province. Chapter 2 introduces the Jewish and polytheistic Semitic traditions, which highlight the importance of these traditions in helping to establish the identity of certain localized cults, for example, when attempting to identify Golgotha's female deity (p. 152).

Chapter 3 details the pagan transformation of Aelia Capitolina, and B. makes a convincing argument for the use of archaeological evidence, to reflect the development and spread of pagan cults, seen in the planning of the town. The plan of the book investigates city by city pagan religious life within the province. The methodological framework employed by B. involves analysing the legal (Chapters 3 and 4) and cultural (Chapters 5 and 6) nature of the cities in Roman Palestine. Chapter 4 investigates the other seven (possibly eight, if we count Ascalon) colonies in the province, highlighting the religious cohabitation that occurred. This is especially useful for those studying Jewish aspects of Roman Palestine, for the amount of cross culturalization that appears to have occurred may explain the use of the pagan motifs that occur in the synagogue environment.

Chapter 5 deals with the cultural aspects in the Greek cities of Philistine origin, highlighting the bicultural nature of the divinities worshipped. A good example is the symbol of the 'Face of Baal', of Phoenician origin, which finds its way onto the coinage of both Antoninus Pius and Hadrian. This 'great god' appears to be capable, during the imperial period, of amalgamating with other divine identities, in particular Zeus.

The Decapolis cities are examined in Chapter 6, notably Beth Shean-Scythopolis, a city whose lifestyle was to rival that of the most opulent Greek cities in Asia and was regularly embellished until the Byzantine period. Throughout this region pagan and Jewish communities lived side by side. However, the Graeco-Roman influence predominates, although there are some traces of Semitic influences to be seen. The

https://doi.org/10.1093/cr/53.1.206 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Hellenic influences are most clearly attested to in the fifth-century house of Leontis, an urban Jewish complex with a synagogue, famous for its representation of the god Nile, Nilometer, and the triumphal scene from the *Odyssey*, the episode of Ulysses and the Sirens.

Chapter 7 reviews the dominant religious trends of the third century. Although many problems isolated the provinces at this period, it did not alter religious trends at work. There is a very good discussion on the slight influence of the Jews upon local pagan cults (p. 292). B. shows that in Palestine, as well as in the rest of the Roman empire, Constantine's reign was not an effective turning point, and that pagan cults continued to flourish until of the end of the fourth century.

It would be extremely difficult to highlight any particular chapter or section, as there is so much relevant information to be found throughout the work. The author uses a variety of source material, historical, archaeological, historical, numismatic, epigraphic, and iconographic, to produce a well-rounded picture of the province. At times the amount of information can be overwhelming, and several readings are needed to assimilate the whole complex picture that often emerges. Nevertheless, this is a most welcome and useful addition to our knowledge of the province during the formative period of Judaism in the centuries that also saw the rise of Christianity.

*University of Wales, Lampeter* SUSAN SOREK

## RELIGION AND MAGIC

S. R. Asirvatham, C. O. Pache, J. Watrous (edd.): *Between Magic and Religion: Interdisciplinary Studies in Ancient Mediterranean Religion and Society*. Pp. xxix + 212, ills. Lanham, Boulder, New York, and Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield, 2001. Paper, £19.95. ISBN: 0-8476-9969-2 (0-8476-9968-4 hbk).

This book offers a collection of papers drawn largely from the colloquium, 'Between Magic and Religion', held at Harvard University in 1998. The colloquium grew out of a Ford Foundation-sponsored workshop, which began in 1996. In the preface, S. A. Takács and M. B. Alexiou explain that the workshop, inspired by graduate students seeking an interdisciplinary forum on ancient religions, was designed to encourage unorthodox questions, controversial explanatory models, and discussion ranging widely, both chronologically and geographically. In the foreword to this latest volume in the series Greek Studies: Interdisciplinary Approaches, Greg Nagy, editor of the series, declares that 'no reader will ever think of "magic" and "religion" the same way after thinking through the findings presented in this book' (p. vii). Nagy's words are hyperbolic, but each of the essays constitutes interesting, worthwhile scholarship.

The essays span time and space from Athens in the fifth century B.C.E. to Rome in the Augustan age, to North America in the seventeenth century C.E. Individual readers may revel in or revolt against the breadth of topics and approaches. Papers are grouped under three distinct headings: (I) Ancient Religion, Self and Other; (II) Man, Hero or God?; and (III) Religious Iconography in Late Antiquity. Part I is further sub-divided into two sections: (A) Greeks and Others; and (B) Roman Magic and Religion from Two Perspectives. In Section A, C. O. Pache argues that the cult of the Thracian goddess Bendis in fifth-century Athens reflects an ancient Greek polar approach to the

© The Classical Association, 2003

https://doi.org/10.1093/cr/53.1.206 Published online by Cambridge University Press