# THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

CTIN
C LOGIC
aging Editor
NAMORI PHOKION KOLAITIS
BULLE
OF
SYMBOLIC
EDITED BY
ROD DOWNEY, Mana
MATTHEW FOREMAN AKIHIRO KAN

EDITED BY

ROD DOWNEY, Managing Editor

MATTHEW FOREMAN AKIHIRO KANAMORI PHOKION
MANUEL LERMAN PENELOPE MADDY KATRIN

REVIEWS EDITORS

ALASDAIR URQUHART, Reviews Managing Editor

LEV BEKLEMISHEV MIRNA DŽAMONJA DAVID E
ERICH GRÄDEL GEOFFREY HELLMAN DENIS HIRS
JULIA KNIGHT MICHAEL C. LASKOWSKI ROGER M
VOLKER PECKHAUS WOLFRAM POHLERS SŁAWOMIR

J KOLAITIS
TENT
EVANS
CHFELDT
MADDUX
SOLECKI

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 19 Nov 2026 at 04:33:36, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1079898600009720

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Kurt Gödel (1906–1978) ..... 129
Preface, by Akihiro Kanamori ..... 131

Articles

The Gödel editorial project: A synopsis, by Solomon Feferman ..... 132
Future tasks for Gödel scholars, by John W. Dawson, Jr. and Cheryl A. Dawson 150
Only two letters: The correspondence between Herbrand and Gödel, by Wilfried Sieg ..... 172
On Gödel's way in: the influence of Rudolf Carnap, by Warren Goldfarb ..... 185
What did Gödel believe and when did he believe it? by Martin Davis ..... 194
Gödel's conceptual realism, by Donald A. Martin ..... 207
Gödel's reformulation of Gentzen's first consistency proof for arithmetic: the no-counterexample interpretation, by W. W. Tait ..... 225

Reviews

W. Sieg, R. Sommer, and C. Talcott, editors, ***Reflections on the Foundations of Mathematics: Essays in Honor of Solomon Feferman***. Reviewed by David Charles McCarty ..... 239
G. Tourlakis, ***Lectures in Logic and Set Theory, vols. I & II***. Reviewed by Joel David Hamkins ..... 241
T. Jech, ***Set theory***. Reviewed by Greg Hjorth ..... 243
D. Perrin and J.-E. Pin, ***Infinite words: automata, semigroups, logic and games***. Reviewed by Thomas Wilke ..... 246
R. Zach, *Hilbert's* 'Verunglückter Beweis'*, the first epsilon theorem, and consistency proofs*. Reviewed by Dirk Schlimm ..... 247

2004 Summer Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Torino, Italy, July 25–31, 2004 ..... 249
Notices ..... 313
Erratum ..... 319

The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic (ISSN 1079-8986) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc., 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604-0001, USA. Periodicals postage is paid at Poughkeepsie NY and at additional mailing offices. The Bulletin is distributed with The Journal of Symbolic Logic; the 2005 annual subscription price for the two journals is $495. Online subscription is available from Project Euclid; visit `http://projecteuclid.org/bsl`. **Postmaster**: Send address changes to ***The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic, Journals Division UIP, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, IL 61820-6903, USA.*** Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, Charles Steinhorn (address on inside back cover).

The Bulletin and the Journal are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in all aspects of symbolic logic. The Bulletin encourages submission of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. The Bulletin also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

*Continued on inside back cover*

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 10 09 08 07 06 05

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 19 Nov 2026 at 04:33:36, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1079898600009720

# THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ROD DOWNEY, Managing Editor

MATTHEW FOREMAN AKIHIRO KANAMORI PHOKION KOLAITIS

MANUEL LERMAN PENELOPE MADDY KATRIN TENT

REVIEWS EDITORS

ALASDAIR URQUHART, Reviews Managing Editor

STEVE AWODEY JOHN BALDWIN LEV BEKLEMISHEV

MIRNA DŽAMONJA DAVID EVANS ERICH GRÄDEL

DENIS HIRSCHFELDT ROGER MADDUX LUKE ONG

VOLKER PECKHAUS WOLFRAM POHLERS SŁAWOMIR SOLECKI

VOLUME 11
2005

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL AND CORPORATE MEMBERS

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 19 Nov 2026 at 04:33:36, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1079898600009720

The four numbers of Volume 11 are copyrighted ©2005 by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. Reproduction of copyrighted numbers of the BULLETIN by photostat, photoprint, microfilm, or like process is forbidden, except by written permission, to be obtained from the Secretary of the Association, Charles Steinhorn, ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.

The paper used in this BULLETIN is acid-free and falls within the guidelines established to ensure permanence and durability.

This BULLETIN has been registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. The appearance of a code at the bottom of the first page of an article indicates the copyright owner's consent for copying beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U. S. Copyright Law, provided that the per-copy fee stated in the code is paid directly to Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. This consent does not extend to copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotion purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. Specific written permission for such copying must be obtained from the Association.

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 19 Nov 2026 at 04:33:36, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1079898600009720

# CONTENTS OF VOLUME 11

Kurt Gödel (1906–1978) ..... 129
KANAMORI, AKIHIRO. Preface ..... 131

ARTICLES

DAVIS, MARTIN. What did Gödel believe and when did he believe it? ..... 194
DAWSON, JR., JOHN W. and DAWSON, CHERYL A. Future tasks for Gödel scholars .. 150
FEFERMAN, SOLOMON. The Gödel editorial project: A synopsis ..... 132
GOLDFARB, WARREN. On Gödel's way in: the influence of Rudolf Carnap ..... 185
KOEPKE, PETER. Turing computations on ordinals ..... 377
MADDY, PENELOPE. Mathematical existence ..... 351
MARTIN, DONALD A. Gödel's conceptual realism ..... 207
SAYED AHMED, TAREK. Algebraic logic, where does it stand today? ..... 465
SIEG, WILFRIED. Only two letters: The correspondence between Herbrand and Gödel 172
SIMMONS, HAROLD. Tiering as a recursion technique ..... 321
SIMPSON, STEPHEN G. Mass problems and randomness ..... 1
TAIT, W. W. Gödel's reformulation of Gentzen's first consistency proof for arithmetic: the no-counterexample interpretation ..... 225

COMMUNICATIONS

BEN-YAACOV, ITAY. Compactness and independence in non first order frameworks 28
GREENBERG, NOAM. The role of true finiteness in the admissible recursively enumerable degrees ..... 398
KONTCHAKOV, ROMAN, KURUCZ, AGI, and ZAKHARYASCHEV, MICHAEL. Undecidability of first-order intuitionistic and modal logics with two variables ..... 428
MILETI, JOSEPH R. Partition theorems and computability theory ..... 411
MOORE, JUSTIN TATCH. Proper forcing, cardinal arithmetic, and uncountable linear orders ..... 51
MUMMERT, CARL and SIMPSON, STEPHEN G. Reverse mathematics and $\Pi^1_2$ comprehension ..... 526
STEPRĀNS, JURIS. Geometric cardinal invariants, maximal functions and a measure theoretic pigeonhole principle ..... 517

REVIEWS

P. Howard and J. E. Rubin ***Consequences of the axiom of choice***. Reviewed by Andreas Blass ..... 61
P. Philipp, ***Logisch-philosophische Untersuchungen***. Reviewed by Alexandra Zinck and Uwe Scheffler ..... 63



Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 19 Nov 2026 at 04:33:36, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1079898600009720

P. T. Johnstone, ***Sketches of an elephant: a topos theory compendium***. Reviewed by Steve Awodey ..... 65
R. Brady (editor), ***Relevant logics and their rivals, Volume II***. Reviewed by Nicholas Griffin ..... 70
N. Griffin (editor), Selected papers from ***The Cambridge companion to Bertrand Russell***. Reviewed by Peter Koellner ..... 72
D. M. Gabbay, A. Kurucz, F. Wolter, and M. Zakharyaschev, ***Many-dimensional modal logics: theory and applications***. Reviewed by Mark Reynolds ..... 77
C. Chihara, ***A structural account of mathematics***. Reviewed by Fraser MacBride ... 79
A. W. F. Edwards, ***Cogwheels of the mind***. Reviewed by Katherine Thompson ..... 83
I. Jané and C. Wright, *Two articles on "relativity"*. Reviewed by Peter Schotch ..... 84
A. Weiermann, *An application of results by Hardy, Ramanujan and Karamata to Ackermannian functions*. Reviewed by Albert A. Mullin ..... 89
J. Dawson (editor), *A Festschrift in honour of Professor Ivor Grattan-Guinness*. Reviewed by Risto Vilkko ..... 89
W. Sieg, R. Sommer, and C. Talcott (editors), ***Reflections on the foundations of mathematics: Essays in honor of Solomon Feferman***. Reviewed by David Charles McCarty ..... 239
G. Tourlakis, ***Lectures in logic and set theory, vols. I & II***. Reviewed by Joel David Hamkins ..... 241
T. Jech, ***Set theory***. Reviewed by Greg Hjorth ..... 243
D. Perrin and J.-E. Pin, ***Infinite words: automata, semigroups, logic and games***. Reviewed by Thomas Wilke ..... 246
R. Zach, *Hilbert's* 'Verunglückter Beweis'*, the first epsilon theorem, and consistency proofs*. Reviewed by Dirk Schlimm ..... 247
G. Mints and R. Muskens (editors), ***Games, logic, and constructive sets***. Reviewed by Ian Hodkinson ..... 439
B. Russell, ***Correspondance avec Louis Couturat (1897–1913)***. Reviewed by Alasdair Urquhart ..... 442
M. Wolff, ***Abhandlung über die Prinzipien der Logik***. Reviewed by Ignacio Angelelli 444
E. H. Reck and S. Awodey (editors), ***Frege's lectures on logic***. Reviewed by Michael Beaney ..... 445
M. Bremer, ***An introduction to paraconsistent logics***. Reviewed by Casey McGinnis 447
S. Shelah, *On cardinal invariants of the continuum*. Reviewed by Juris Steprāns ..... 451
D. Christensen, ***Putting logic in its place***. Reviewed by Henry E. Kyburg, Jr. ..... 534
A. B. Feferman and S. Feferman, ***Alfred Tarski, Life and Logic***. Reviewed by Roger D. Maddux ..... 535
B. J. Copeland (editor), ***The essential Turing***. Reviewed by Jan Obdržálek ..... 541
Three papers by I. Neeman. Reviewed by Paul B. Larson ..... 542

MEETINGS OF THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

2004 Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA, May 19–23, 2004 ..... 92

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 19 Nov 2026 at 04:33:36, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1079898600009720

2004 Summer Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Torino, Italy, July 25–31, 2004 ..... 249
2004–05 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Atlanta Marriott Marquis, Atlanta, Georgia, January 7–8, 2005 ..... 454
2005 Spring Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, The Westin St. Francis Hotel, San Francisco, CA, March 25–26, 2005 ..... 547

MEETINGS SPONSORED BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC

11th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation (WoLLIC '2004), Fontainebleau (Univ. Paris XII), France, July 19–22, 2004 ..... 120
Logic, Computability, and Randomness, Córdoba, Argentina, September 20–24, 2004 ..... 557
12th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation (WoLLIC '2005), Florianópolis (Santa Catarina), Brazil, July 19-22, 2005 ..... 558

Corrigendum to "In memoriam: Walter Felscher, 1931–2000" ..... 545
Erratum ..... 319

Notices ..... 122, 313, 461, 620
Officers and Committees of the Association for Symbolic Logic ..... 560
Members of the Association ..... 564

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 19 Nov 2026 at 04:33:36, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1079898600009720