Contents

Acknowledgments *page* ix

Introduction 1
I.1 A Puzzle 1
I.2 Underdetermination: From Science to Ethics 3
I.3 Demarcating the Main Idea 6
I.4 The Plan for the Book 8

PART I SCIENTIFIC UNDERDETERMINATION AND THE ANALOGY TO ETHICS

1 Underdetermination in Science 13
1.1 Introducing the Idea and Its Earliest Forerunners 13
1.2 Three Paths to Underdetermination 23
1.3 Varieties of Underdetermination 29

2 The Analogy to the Moral Realm 35
2.1 The Underlying Picture of Moral Theories 36
2.2 The Evidence of Moral Theories 53
2.3 Complications 61

PART II UNDERDETERMINATION IN NORMATIVE ETHICS

3 Parfit and the Case Study of Case Studies 73
3.1 Doubting the Dogma 74
3.2 Climbing the Mountain 77
3.3 Failed Conciliation and Moral Underdetermination 80

4 Going Algorithmic 89
4.1 Consequentializing: A Simple Recipe and a Two-Step Procedure 90
4.2 Deontologizing: Leveling the Playing Field 98
4.3 Algorithms and Underdetermination 107

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 14 Nov 2026 at 18:01:48, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009492454

5 The Big Picture in Normative Ethics 120
5.1 The Roads to Moral Underdetermination 120
5.2 Varieties of the Phenomenon 133
5.3 Where to Go from Here 151

PART III SKEPTICISM AND A NEW METAETHICAL POSITION

6 Skeptical Repercussions 161
6.1 Duhem and Quine Again 161
6.2 From a Semantic to an Epistemic Challenge 165
6.3 Adapting the Skeptical Argument to the Realm of Ethics 169
6.4 In Defense of the Argument 174

7 A New Position in Metaethics 185
7.1 Constructive Empiricism and Constructive Deonticism 186
7.2 Classifying the New View 196
7.3 Two Worries 206

8 Looking Back and Ahead 212
8.1 How We Got Here 212
8.2 The Puzzle Solved? 220

Bibliography 223
Index 234

Downloaded from https://www.cambridge.org/core. UNIVERSIDAD AUTONOMA METROPOLITANA, on 14 Nov 2026 at 18:01:48, subject to the Cambridge Core terms of use, available at https://www.cambridge.org/core/terms. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009492454